



STATE OF NEW JERSEY

**FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE ACTION
OF THE
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION**

In the Matter of Patricia Panaro,
Grants Specialist (PS4911P),
Department of Law and Public Safety

Examination Appeal

CSC Docket No. 2018-860

ISSUED: APRIL 2, 2018 (SLK)

Patricia Panaro appeals the determination of the Division of Agency Services (Agency Services) that she did not meet the education and experience requirements for the promotional examination for Grants Specialist (PS4911P), Department of Law and Public Safety.

The examination at issue was announced with specific requirements that had to be announced May 22, 2017 closing. The education requirements were a Bachelor’s degree including or supplemented by 21 semester hours of credit in accounting. The experience requirements were four years of accounting experience including two years of experience in the coordination of grant funding in a public or private organization including experience with automated cost accounting systems. The appellant was the only employee who applied for the subject examination and was deemed ineligible. Therefore, the examination was cancelled due to a lack of qualified candidates.

On her application, the appellant indicated that she possessed a Bachelor’s degree in General Studies/Business Management, including eight accounting credits, and a Master’s degree in Administration of Justice/Homeland Security. Additionally, the appellant indicated that she was provisionally serving in the subject title from August 2016 to the May 22, 2017 closing date, a Contract Administrator 1 from June 2015 to August 2016, an Administrative Analyst 3 from December 2013 to June 2015, a Division Planning Analyst for Burlington Coat Factory from September 1998 to February 2010, and in various other positions for

Burlington Coat Factory from October 1991 to September 1998. Agency Services credited the appellant for having met the general education requirement and eight accounting credits, but indicated that she lacked 13 accounting credits. Additionally, it credited the appellant for having 10 months of the required experience based on her provisional service in the subject title, but determined that she lacked three years and two months of the required experience.

On appeal, the appellant submits a letter from the appointing authority in support of her appeal. Specifically, the appointing authority submits a prior classification determination letter from Agency Services that indicates that the appellant was performing the duties of the subject title. Additionally, the appointing authority asserts that the appellant is the only employee in her unit who can perform the duties of the subject title and, without her knowledge and expertise, the Emergency Management Section would not be able to process various and budget and grant requests.

CONCLUSION

N.J.A.C. 4A:4-2.6(a) provides that applicants shall meet all requirements specified in the promotional announcement by the closing date. *N.J.A.C.* 4A:1-1.2(c) states that the Civil Service Commission (Commission) may relax a rule for good cause in order to effectuate the purposes of Title 11A, New Jersey Statutes.

In this matter, Agency Services correctly determined that the appellant did not meet the announced examination requirements as she lacked the required college credits in Accounting. Further, the primary focus of her experience in her positions outside of her provisional service in the subject title was not in accounting. However, it cannot be ignored that the appellant has years of experience analyzing budgets in positions both in and out of State service. Additionally, Agency Services determined that the appellant was performing the duties of the subject title while serving as a Contract Administrator 1. Further, the appellant's application indicates that she was preparing grant applications while serving as an Administrative Analyst 3, and the appointing authority indicates that the appellant is the only one in her unit who has the knowledge and expertise to perform the duties of the subject title. Moreover, the examination has been cancelled due to a lack of qualified applicants and the appellant continues to serve provisionally in the subject title. Therefore, under these circumstances, good cause exists to relax the provisions of *N.J.A.C.* 4A:4-2.6(a) and accept her education and experience, for eligibility purposes only, and admit her to the subject examination.

ORDER

Therefore, it is ordered that the appeal be granted, the cancellation of the examination be rescinded and Patricia Panaro's application be processed for prospective employment opportunities only.

This is the final administrative determination in this matter. Any further review should be pursued in a judicial forum.

DECISION RENDERED BY THE
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION ON
THE 27th DAY OF MARCH, 2018



Deirdre L. Webster Cobb
Acting Chairperson
Civil Service Commission

Inquiries
and
Correspondence

Christopher S. Myers
Director
Division of Appeals
and Regulatory Affairs
Civil Service Commission
Written Record Appeals Unit
P.O. Box 312
Trenton, New Jersey 08625-0312

c: Patricia Panaro
Jessica Chainese
Kelly Glenn
Records Center